

## **A Summary of Evaluations and Studies Commissioned by TBBC since 1994**

TBBC recognised many years ago that evaluations requested by Donors and carried out by external consultants were a very valuable tool for helping to analyse problems and challenges and to design organisational and programmatic responses. So much so in fact that TBBC soon began to commission its own studies to address particular issues of concern. Since 1994, altogether there have now been 25 studies and evaluations, half of which TBBC commissioned directly.

This summary lists the main conclusions of each study/ evaluation, the main recommendations, TBBC's responses and any outstanding issues. Almost all of the consultant's recommendations have been implemented. The summary demonstrates clearly how this has helped TBBC to keep abreast of best practice and to develop as an organisation.

#	Date	Agency	Topic	Main conclusions	Main recommendations	Main responses	Outstanding
1	Mar 1994	Dutch Inter-churchAid/ EC/ Femconsult.	Overall	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC is successful in establishing and maintaining a reliable relief supply delivery system with a minimal external staff presence (3). But concern expressed for staff contingency provision.</li> <li>Accountability high.</li> <li>The community based monitoring approach adopted by BBC is endorsed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Contingency to cover staff emergencies</li> <li>Standardise food rations</li> <li>Record monitoring visits</li> <li>Request MOI approval for skills training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff numbers increased to 8 by 1996</li> <li>Food rations standardised in following years</li> <li>Staff monitoring visits recorded from 1994</li> <li>Skills training remained impossible throughout the 1980s and 1990s</li> </ul>	
2	Nov 1996	Dutch Inter-churchAid/ Femconsult.	Monitoring System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased staffing has been essential ... and further increases may be necessary.</li> <li>Monitoring system introduced has made more visible checks which were in effect already in place and has made the checking system more systematic.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Clearer instruction to field staff</li> <li>Include records of actual distribution to households</li> <li>Include checking frequency of checking of indicators</li> <li>Review systems with camp leaders</li> </ul>	All implemented from 1996	
3	Apr 1997	ECHO	Overall	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC is perfectly integrated into the international and local NGO's framework and plays a central role in the assistance to Burmese refugees with 13 years experience.</li> <li>One major BBC objective is to reach a maximum degree of self-management in the camps. The implemented monitoring system is community based. In different parts of the world this approach may not function, but GFE became convinced that the system applied by BBC works.</li> <li>Altogether, the BBC operation appeared well managed, the BBC staff is highly motivated and handles the assigned tasks professionally</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support to BBC should continue</li> <li>Additional needs may arise for firewood and construction material as refugees do not have access to natural resources</li> <li>Donors should hold their promises and pay on time to help BBC's permanent cash-flow difficulties</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ECHO support had continued</li> <li>Cooking fuel and building materials were introduced in some places during the period 1995 to 1997 as the camps were consolidated, then progressively standardised in all camps to provide an adequate basic ration</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cash-flow remains a perennial problem although ECHO is now one of the most reliable</li> </ul>
4	Sep 1997	Independent*	Ration Nutrition Adequacy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Rations were established assuming refugees would have a degree of self-sufficiency. Recent restrictions placed on the refugees have decreased their ability to supplement the rations.</li> <li>The current adult ration supplies nearly adequate energy and protein, meets RDA for calcium, but is very low in micro-nutrients</li> <li>Ration for &lt;5s is inadequate, substantially less than the RDA for energy, protein and micronutrients, except calcium</li> <li>Refugees vulnerable because lack of dietary variety increases risk of micronutrient deficiency</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Adult ration should be calculated to supply 100% of the adult RDA for all nutrients taking into account availability of non-ration foods</li> <li>One standard rations should be provided to all refugees, regardless of age</li> <li>Access to and availability of dependable non-ration food sources should be fostered and maintained</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mung beans and cooking oil added to basic food basket to provide minimum 2,100 kcals/ person/ day</li> <li>MOI insisted on half rations for children</li> <li>TBBC later supported the CAN project to cultivate sources of non-ration foods in the refugee diet</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MOI still insists on half-rations for &lt;12 year olds although TBBC is able to deliver supplies with half rations for &lt; 5 year olds.</li> </ul>
5	Nov 1997	ECHO	Finance/ Admin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No written report was ever received</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC did not receive formal recommendations but issues discussed included the need for tendering</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Following the first donors meeting in October 1996, BBC upgraded all its financial and administrative procedures during 1997. Formal tendering and quality control procedures were introduced incrementally from 2000</li> </ul>	
6	May 1998	Dutch Inter-church Aid/ International Agricultural Centre	Supplementary Feeding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The SF programmes and target groups are justified for direct nutritional and/ or indirect reasons. Phasing out is not yet appropriate. Current foodstuffs covered by BBC are appropriate.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Programme monitoring lack clarity. It is necessary to record different programme complexities with data that can be interpreted in consistent ways.</li> <li>The different protocols should be reviewed jointly and harmonization within reasonable boundaries is recommended</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC recruited a nutritionist in 2000 who worked with the Health agencies to implement the recommendations</li> <li>More comprehensive reporting forms and standardised entrance and exit criteria standardised feeding protocols were introduced and later implemented.</li> </ul>	
7	Apr 2000	DanChurchAid	Sphere Standards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC and the medical agencies are generally performing well against SPHERE Minimum Standards and Key Indicators.</li> <li>The acceptance of the Burmese Border Medical Guidelines and utilization of the CCSDPT Common basic Data Collection Format reflect strong interest by the Health agencies to work together on common health standards.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC and Health agencies should consider possible micronutrient deficiencies</li> <li>BBC and Health agencies should consider gender issue and develop strategies and policies</li> <li>BBC should hire a nutritionist</li> <li>BBC should consider the distribution of soap and water containers in line with SHPERE standards</li> <li>Health agencies should provide BBC with health and nutrition indicators</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC recruited a nutritionist in 2000</li> <li>Nutrition surveys were conducted in 2001/2</li> <li>Adjustments were made to the food basket to address micronutrient and other deficiencies, including the addition of fortified flour from 2004</li> <li>CCSDPT recruited a Health Information Officer in 2001 to develop and implement the border-wide system for health information reporting.</li> <li>Annual nutrition surveys commenced in 2001</li> <li>Soap distributions were eventually introduced in 2007</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Systematic distribution of water containers remains a gap for the health agencies in the CCSDPT/ UNHCR Comprehensive Plan for 2007/8</li> </ul>

8	May 2000	UNHCR Consultant*	Cooking Fuel	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Pricing of BBC supplies was judged to be fair and competitive.</li> <li>Overall ration averages 6-7 Kg/ person/month.</li> <li>Distribution appears to run smoothly and fairly.</li> <li>Fuel consumption surveys showed a diverse use of fuel for cooking and non-cooking purposes.</li> <li>The survey suggest BBC ration meets less than half of actual demands</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Promote the use of improved stoves and energy saving cooking methods</li> <li>Distribute fuel on a family size curve increasing the average ration in most camps</li> <li>Improve fuel quality by supplying more saw-dust derived fuel</li> <li>Improve quality control and monitoring</li> <li>Experiment with firewood</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Stove making projects were supported</li> <li>Family size curves implemented for ration distribution</li> <li>Laboratory testing of all charcoal orders introduced</li> <li>Different charcoal products have been tested and evaluated</li> <li>Firewood was piloted in two camps from 2000</li> </ul>	
9	Mar 2003	Independent*	Management and Governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC has done an excellent job in its service to displaced Burmese.</li> <li>Although the BBC has striven to adapt itself organisationally, governance and management functions have remained vested mostly in the directorship. BBC's governance and management structure is currently inadequate to support the type of organisation that BBC needs to become to sustain its relevance and viability.</li> <li>BBC must implement governance and management as distinct functions, devolve responsibility and authority, institutionalise leadership, and increase internal capacity and improve technical competence.</li> <li>There is an internal sense of readiness for change and a commitment, particularly on the part of the board and management, to undertake change through well-considered processes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Prepare a mission statement</li> <li>Prepare a Strategic plan</li> <li>Strengthen organisational structure.</li> <li>Recruit technical expertise to increase capacity to develop partnerships etc.</li> <li>To maximise the potential of a consortium the BBC could seek to broaden and expand its membership, strengthen membership requirements and benefits and invite more participation of members</li> </ul>	<p>The evaluation lead to the retention of the consultant to help the board and management implement the recommendations. Over the next 18 months some of the major achievements were;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A mission statement was written</li> <li>Job descriptions were re-written, organisational structure upgraded and middle management recruited</li> <li>Byelaws, Articles of Association and Memorandum, of Association were drawn up</li> <li>TBBC was registered in the UK on October 2004 and gained status as a Charitable Company in May 2005</li> <li>Membership of the new TBBC was 10 agencies from 8 countries (5 previously)</li> <li>A Strategic Plan was drawn up in 2005</li> </ul>	
10	Jun 2003	IRC	Procurement/ Quality Control	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Taking into consideration the social, cultural and commercial environment, BBC should be commended for their present operational set-up and having implemented procurement procedures in detail, following those of general frameworks under the existing donor's criteria.</li> <li>It is the Consultants perception that the Procurement Operations within BBC are one of the better structured in regard to international donor criteria in recent years. Therefore, the suggested actions are only such, suggested actions to be taken where appropriate</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Procurement Officer is overworked and additional staff is required</li> <li>Training on procurement procedures and regulations should be held for Field Administrators.</li> <li>Though certain Suppliers are often able to out-play competitors, it is good practice to introduce and apply other and smaller Suppliers</li> <li>Conduct as many inspections as possible in the camps</li> <li>Employ one or two Quality Control officers, reducing the need for Inspection Companies. Could also act as "roaming" trouble-shooters on other issues.</li> <li>Staff should visit Suppliers Factories or Mills, work and spend time with them.</li> <li>Godown managers/teams should be trained on inspection procedures.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Assistant procurement officer recruited</li> <li>Field staff have received training in procurement procedures</li> <li>Contracts are awarded to new and smaller suppliers</li> <li>95% of inspections are now carried out in camps</li> <li>Staff visit suppliers and their factories/mills</li> <li>Warehouse teams are trained in quality control</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC has not considered it appropriate to employ inspectors preferring to rely on independent companies.</li> </ul>
11	Jul 2003	Independent*	Cooking Fuel	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>BBC clearly took the findings and suggestions of the 2000 study seriously. Most of the recommendations were implemented to the letter.</li> <li>There seems to have been an institutional commitment within TBBC to become better informed on issues of fuel supply and staff clearly now far more competent.</li> <li>The situation is much improved, but still not perfect....</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ensure distribution of fuel efficient stoves</li> <li>Apply modified family size distribution curve to all camps and increase average ration to 7.9 kg/person/month (11%)</li> <li>Introduce penalties for poor quality supplies</li> <li>Provide additional firewood for heating to Umpiem Mai camp</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Distributions of fuel efficient stoves have been made border-wide</li> <li>Ration curves were adopted as recommended</li> <li>Penalties are now enforced for poor supplies</li> <li>Additional firewood is supplied to Umpiem Mai</li> </ul>	

12	Oct 2003	ECHO	Audit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The administrative structure of the BBC appears light, which has the advantage of keeping overhead costs low. Reliance has traditionally been placed on the refugees but some missing real expertise in the financial control area has not ensured some fundamental controls being carried out by the BBC themselves.</li> <li>• The BBC orders materials for the refugees based on the refugees' own estimates. The ordered quantities are paid for. There is no verification by the BBC of quantities delivered nor the overall amounts distributed to refugees</li> <li>• The BBC has shown itself open to change and improvement and this attitude augurs well so long as professional project financial control is achieved.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Accruals accounting should be put in place immediately for major cost items.</li> <li>• The BBC needs to have its own goods received notes (GRN's) which are completed and afterwards checked to supplier delivery advices.</li> <li>• Supplier delivery advice notes should be sent directly from the supplier to the BBC. A copy of the BBC GRN can be given to the lorry driver as proof of delivery.</li> <li>• A process needs to be put in place to provide the BBC with clear and overall assurance that the quantities and quality of delivered material are correct. It is necessary for BBC staff - both local and expatriate - to perform regular counts and checks on delivered materials.</li> <li>• Monthly summary reporting of the level of rejects should be put in place with target levels</li> <li>• A system should be put in place to summarise the actual distributions based on the ration card information. The quality of data on the ration cards will need to be improved.</li> <li>• A monthly reconciliation should be made between the goods delivered and distributed based on ration cards with an explanation of the use of the remaining sacks of rice.</li> <li>• Equipment used for distribution should be validated and calibrated prior to use. Hence, for the rice, the weight capacity of the tins should be verified at least once per day and the scales should equally be verified using standard weights</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• After the ECHO audit and the ECHO Nutrition/ Food Aid Evaluation (following) two consultants were recruited in 2004 to review TBBC's Monitoring and Financial Control procedures (see below). All recommendations were addressed.</li> </ul>	
----	----------	------	-------	---	---	---	--

13	Nov 2003	ECHO	Nutrition/ Food Aid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It is clear that the intended beneficiaries have received the project's foreseen and planned benefits. Refugees take primary responsibility of all distribution operations in the camp. Women are underrepresented.</li> <li>After in depth inquiries it can be said that, by and large, the population figures used to calculate deliveries of commodities to the camps are correct.</li> <li>Tenders comply with ECHO standards</li> <li>The transport of commodities is judged to be efficient</li> <li>Most quality controls are well within minimum ECHO requirements</li> <li>Warehouses are of rather poor quality</li> <li>The basic ration is under review is to be more balanced; it adds blended food. This action is long overdue</li> <li>BBC's attempts to improve quality of the health agencies' SF programmes by providing them with written guidelines has not been successful</li> <li>Growth monitoring of infants is discontinued after their mothers are discharged from the post-natal SFP.</li> <li>Efforts have been made to give gender issues greater prominence, but effective results are yet to be seen.</li> <li>Logical frameworks used (2003) are quite inadequate</li> <li>The actual use of monitoring data to adjust ongoing operations has been weak</li> <li>EU visibility in the camps is judged to be sufficient</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recruit key staff in new organisational structure</li> <li>Review gender related activities</li> <li>Adopt accrual accounting and grant tracking</li> <li>Design and test Goods Received Notes</li> <li>Improve monitoring and quality control</li> <li>Review and separate camp management needs and introduce refugee incentives</li> <li>Review warehouse standards and introduce standard weights, measuring containers</li> <li>Establish legal entity and good governance</li> <li>Develop strategic plan and link logical framework</li> <li>Establish financial controls</li> <li>Pilot and get MOI approval for blended food in all camps</li> <li>TBBC play an active role in CCSDPT Health Sub Committee</li> <li>Share evaluation with Health agencies and agree implementation of recommendations</li> <li>Conduct micronutrient survey</li> <li>Further develop CAN project</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2 middle managers, 2 admin assistants, 4 field assistants recruited 2004/5</li> <li>Community Liaison officer recruited Jan 05.</li> <li>Role of women in food distribution significantly increased</li> <li>QuickBooks installed to facilitate accrual accounting and grant tracking</li> <li>Monitoring consultancy commissioned to address monitoring and quality control issues</li> <li>Camp management project initiated which separates camp management needs from feeding population and introduced refugee incentives for all workers.</li> <li>All warehouses upgraded based on WFP guidelines. Standard weights and measures introduced.</li> <li>TBBC was registered in October 2005 and the first Board constituted that month</li> <li>Strategic Plan prepared 2005 and logframe made compatible.</li> <li>Financial consultancy commissioned to help design financial control procedures (see below)</li> <li>Blended food was piloted and introduced to all camps by end of 2004</li> <li>TBBC has chaired or co-chaired the Health Sub Committee and played a leading role in recruiting and supervising the Health Information Officer and improving the CCSDPT border-wide health data system.</li> <li>Evaluation shared with CCSDPT health agencies and Nutrition Task Force established to oversee implementation of ECHO recommendations, including: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Nutrition Task Force established and maintained</li> <li>Standardized guidelines and protocols and reporting procedures for selective feeding programmes adopted that adhere to international guidelines, including adding blended food to feeding protocols</li> <li>MUAC screening for pregnant/lactating women and enrolment as new SFP target group adopted in all camps</li> <li>Growth monitoring protocols standardized, z-scores growth charts developed and implemented</li> <li>Standardized annual nutrition surveys conducted in all camps using standard equipment</li> <li>Nutrition education materials developed and distributed</li> </ol> </li> <li>CDC nutrition/micronutrient survey in Umpiem Mai in 2004, repeated 2006</li> <li>CAN project has been extended to 8 camps and is central to TBBC nutrition/ food security programme</li> </ul>	
14	Aug 2004	Independent*	Monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall, TBBC has a number of monitoring mechanisms in place, to record deliveries, storage and ration distribution, and there are no major weaknesses apparent.</li> <li>Two areas where improvements could be made are the redesign of forms used and the incorporation of monitoring data into regular management meetings, at a Field and Head Office level, where decisions and action will be taken arising from this data.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Field office use Camp Supply Calculation Form to calculate monthly orders</li> <li>TBBC require Godowns to issue Goods Received Note as proof of delivery, and Godowns weigh at least 10% of all sacks and record this on the GRN.</li> <li>Field assistants to review all GRNs and summarise on a monthly Delivery Summary</li> <li>Godowns to be visited monthly by Field Staff, to assess their condition, using the WFP guidelines. Household visits to continue but Field staff to also meet monthly with focus groups in camps</li> <li>Produce monthly summaries of inspections, highlighting percentage passes for goods professionally inspected.</li> <li>Monthly Monitoring Summaries to be collated and reviewed at monthly management meetings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Additional field assistants recruited to expand monitoring capacity</li> <li>GRN form designed and all monitoring forms revised and made user-friendly</li> <li>Checking rates determined for all monitoring controls and carried out monthly for each camp</li> <li>Reports on Godowns carried out monthly using WFP guidelines</li> <li>Monthly monitoring reports compiled and collated monthly</li> <li>Monthly monitoring results considered at monthly management meetings to inform programme adjustments.</li> <li>Monthly monitoring reports are summarised in TBBC 6 month reports</li> <li>A staff person has been recruited to oversee monitoring reports (Programme Support Manager)</li> </ul>	

15	Sep 2004	Independent*	Financial control	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A comprehensive review of the Financial Control Procedures concludes that there are no major weaknesses in internal control. Discussions with the current auditors of TBBC confirmed this view.</li> <li>• With minor exceptions there are adequate checks and controls in the areas of segregation of duties, authorisation and approval procedures and data protection.</li> <li>• Asset procurement and management policies are well-documented and implemented.</li> <li>• Some procedural changes in various areas are recommended particularly in the area of budgetary control and cash management, and these have been incorporated within the draft Financial Procedures Manual</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tighter budgetary control procedures should be adopted prior to monthly cash transfers to Field Offices.</li> <li>• A management budget committee should be established and meet regularly to plan, implement and revise budgets and discuss and remedy variances between actual and budget expenditure</li> <li>• The Finance function should be elevated to the second tier of management and be separated from administration</li> <li>• The Finance function should be headed temporarily by a Chief Finance Officer (CFO) who should preferably be a qualified ... who can deal authoritatively and confidently with the Board, the Board Finance Committee and the auditors</li> <li>• The current Finance Manager should be groomed to assume the role of CFO within two years.</li> <li>• Audit for 2005 should be put out to competitive tender</li> <li>• Audit scope of services should include additional audit-related and non-audit related service provision</li> <li>• The accounting reference date should be changed to 31 December</li> <li>• The Board should take all necessary steps to instil a "culture of compliance" within TBBC and ensure that there exists a corporate information and reporting system, designed to prevent fraud and mismanagement</li> <li>• The Board should adopt governance policies and procedures that assist individual Board members in making informed decisions in the best interests of TBBC.</li> <li>• A Finance and Audit Committee with specific documented functions and comprising several directors should be established reporting to the Board</li> <li>• A Capacity-Building Programme should be considered with different components, specific outputs and indicators to improve capacity at different levels within TBBC including Board governance, human resource development (TBBC personnel and Camp Committees),</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Financial control procedures have been drawn up and implemented</li> <li>• Field office cash requests have been standardised</li> <li>• Budgets are reviewed every 6 months by management with inputs from key staff. Monthly comparisons are made between expenditures and budget</li> <li>• An experienced, qualified Financial Controller was recruited</li> <li>• The finance manger is being trained but is unlikely to be able to assume the Financial Control role in the near future</li> <li>• The 2005 audit was put to public tender although only one firm was interested</li> <li>• The scope of audit was considerably expanded to meet UK company and charity requirements</li> <li>• The financial year was changed to the calendar year in 2005.</li> <li>• The Board has developed governance policies including "Executive boundaries: Standards of ethics and prudence"</li> <li>• The Board had developed a Governance Guide and a Board Job description.</li> <li>• A consultant was recruited to develop staff development programmes</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The new TBBC governance structure has been in place since September 2004 and the immediate priority of the Board was to establish policies and put in place procedures. This work is now done and the Board has acknowledged the need now to evaluate Board performance. This may identify further capacity building requirements</li> </ul>
16	Feb 2005	AIDCO	Rice and building materials	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The project is well designed, well managed and well implemented by a committed contractor. It fully complies with EC tendering procedures and regulations and has put a performing monitoring system in place, which does not call for any auxiliary improvement.</li> <li>• Having to deal with multiple donors, a lot of attention of the project's management and implementation team could be diverted by excessive monitoring and evaluation missions imposed by the various donors.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Additional recommendations are not needed in respect of project implementation and the project could serve as an example of good practice in the field of food aid programmes.</li> <li>• The present report confirms that all systems in place are performing and reliable. It could therefore be circulated to all donors involved in the TBBC programme and serve as a reference to avoid duplication of similar reviews</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The evaluation was circulated to all donors and quoted in the TBBC 6 month report</li> </ul>	

17	Jul 2005	Independent*	Staff remuneration	<p>Objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Through a participatory process with TBBC's Board of Directors and staff, the consultant will recommend for consideration:</li> </ul> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>An appropriate position in the market place regarding overall levels of compensation and benefits practice</li> <li>A staffing and remuneration policy</li> <li>A compensation and benefits structure, which will be internally equitable and externally competitive.</li> </ol> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC is unique in the market using one salary scale for both international and national staff</li> <li>TBBC has a philosophy of providing equity in compensation depending on the position and where possible, not making differences based on national origin.</li> <li>The TBBC compensation policy should clearly state the objectives of the compensation practices and that TBBC staff come from two distinctly different markets. TBBC management must reinforce this policy message by differentiating between the meaning of equity and equality and being very transparent on the different packages awarded to international and national staff.</li> <li>Both national and international staff have a high job satisfaction level and expressed a high degree of commitment to the work of TBBC.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The job evaluation resulted in creating 8 job grades with most international staff holding positions in the top four grades E to H.</li> <li>TBBC position the agency at the 100<sup>th</sup> percentile of benchmark INGO, this is not the top of the market, but pegs the salary to an international agency, a member of TBBC, and an agency that bases its scale on the INGO market</li> <li>Eliminate a fixed step scale for annual increments to allow more flexibility and an ability to adjust for inflation without artificially inflating the scale.</li> <li>Annual increments and COLA should be given at the same time each year. Synchronize annual increases to simplify and not have to adjust salaries except once a year</li> <li>There were also a number of recommendations regarding benefits</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Revised salary scales (8 grades) were implemented from 1<sup>st</sup> January 2006, backdated to the date of incorporation of TBBC in October 2004</li> <li>Salaries in the top grades were set lower than the benchmark INGO. Lower grade salaries were generally considered already very competitive with the local market.</li> <li>All terms were adjusted for future January 1<sup>st</sup> reviews for all staff</li> <li>Fixed salary increments were abolished and fixed salary ranges for each grade established</li> <li>Benefit adjustments were implemented at the same time, particularly relating to housing costs, education allowances and family health coverage</li> <li>A new and improved Provident Fund was established taking advance of TBBC's new legal status and increasing TBBC contributions</li> </ul>	
18	2006	Independent*	Staff policy and Gender sensitivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In assessing TBBC's staff policy, I have drawn on benchmarks set by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) standards, especially Article 183 on Maternity Leave. Where ILO standards are not relevant, that is paternity leave or HIV/AIDS policies, I have drawn on good practices from other non-government organisations (NGOs), such as Action Aid, Care International and Oxfam.</li> <li>The TBBC policy as it stands can be considered a gender sensitive document. Language used in the policy is gender sensitive and equity between men and women is promoted. However, the TBBC policy can be improved in terms of being more <i>responsive</i> to the different needs and interests of men and women.</li> <li>From a gender equity perspective, the Code of Conduct is well written and clearly documents the processes to address issues such as harassment, exploitation and discrimination in a sensitive way.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the sick leave policy could be more gender responsive. The requirement that sick leave will only be granted when a staff member is living in the same house as a sick person fails to recognise the role that women play (in all societies) as carers.</li> <li>The policy related to Maternity/ Paternity leave could be improved</li> <li>TBBC could better meet the needs of male and female staff members by promoting flexible working hours and working from home.</li> <li>In the area of training, it may be appropriate to include a special provision for women to attend training in areas such as leadership or management depending on the organisational needs and current human resource statistics</li> <li>Women should not have to undergo pregnancy tests when applying for TBBC employment</li> <li>TBBC should consider strengthening gender equity through the establishment of a taskforce. Or strengthen gender sensitivity and responsiveness of the human resources department and management.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The consultant recommended specific changes in the Staff policy manual and almost all were adopted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC will review its gender responses in the workplace once a human resource manager has been recruited</li> </ul>
19	2006	Independent*	Staff Policy and Thai Labour law	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Labour Protection Act ("LPA") provides minimum rights of the employees. However, most provisions of LPA, including severance pay, will not apply to TBBC, which is not-for-profit</li> <li>Staff Policy is the work rules and regulations of the employer. These are considered as part of the employment contract. They will be enforced and bound by TBBC and staff as part of terms and conditions of the employment contract.</li> <li>No provision in the Staff Policy is contradictory to LPA. The terms and conditions in the Staff Policy are of a high standard, so will be legally enforceable to TBBC and its staff</li> <li>According to the Social Security Act, TBBC staff, both expatriate and Thai are not exempt</li> <li>Staff whose employment ceases due to the expiration of their contract or due to age of retirement have no right to severance pay</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC has discretionary right to amend the Staff in case of necessity, such as, in case of financial difficulty.</li> <li>TBBC should consider and make clear whether the Staff Policy should apply to part time and short-term employees, contract employees, consultants or contractors</li> <li>TBBC must register all staff member with the Social Security. Deductions of salaries of the staff members and contributions from TBBC must be made.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All recommendations have been incorporated in the TBBC Staff manual. The main changes were:</li> <li>In exceptional circumstances Staff Policies can be changed by Management at any time</li> <li>Staff are not entitled to severance pay when completing contracts or on retirement</li> <li>All staff are now members of the national Social Security scheme</li> </ul>	

20	Jul 2006	Independent*	Staff development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It is broadly recognised by the TBBC management team that specific human resources and learning and development (HR/L&amp;D) frameworks need to be developed and implemented within TBBC to build the capacity of its staff members. This will enable TBBC to respond more effectively to the humanitarian relief and development needs of displaced people from Burma, as outlined in TBBC's Strategic Plan. There are no recruitment issues, as TBBC is seen as an "employer of choice" amongst other NGO staff, and attrition of staff has been negligible since its inception.</li> <li>Morale is generally high with most staff members hugely passionate about their contribution to the work of TBBC.</li> <li>The HR/L&amp;D frameworks identified for development and implementation, more specifically include the formulation of a comprehensive staff development programme and the introduction of a performance management system.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A review of all positions was undertaken to determine the technical and behavioural competencies for each role. Job profiles were formulated for each position to supplement the job descriptions, now providing much more clarity for the staff member about performance expectations.</li> <li>The most critical competency required at present is management skills, in particular for Supervisors. Historically, the incumbents in these roles were recruited without requiring any previous management experience.</li> <li>A Performance Management System has been designed to link individual job performance to the attainment of TBBC's vision, mission and goals. Performance objectives are defined from the organisation level to an individual level and include the competencies and behaviours to achieve those objectives</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Each staff person has an individual development plan</li> <li>Courses are being sourced by the Human Resources Manager</li> <li>The new performance management system was launched on 1 January 2007 but had to be simplified subject to further training.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitoring of staff development plans and further enhancement of the staff performance appraisal system awaits the recruitment of a Human Resources Manager, hopefully by mid-2007</li> </ul>
21	Jul 2006	DanChurchAid*	Packaging TBBC programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traditionally, TBBC presents itself as a relief organisation providing food and assistance. In general, many donors show an interest in long term strategies and development aspects of a programme. TBBC in cooperation with DanChurchAid is exploring ways in which TBBC can present itself to its donors in a different light, by repackaging parts of the programme into more 'concrete' and development-relief-oriented activities through which donors can feel more sense of progress and achievement. The idea is to reformulate/focus presentation of the TBBC programme to emphasize the development aspects of the programme, making TBBC more eligible to a broader donor base.</li> <li>TBBC shows definite signs of a long term strategy and a developmental approach to 'relief aid'. Much of what makes TBBC successful is the way the organisation cares for and respects the refugees. The programme includes elements of ensuring rights/awareness creation and capacity building, but these are not explicitly defined anywhere. These elements can be drawn out as key selling points for attracting development-oriented donors.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All former donors should be approached</li> <li>TBBC's strategy of approaching existing donors to ensure their continued support through 'multi-year funding' and 'good humanitarian donor ship' should continue</li> <li>We do not recommend pursuing private donors.</li> <li>Only look at corporate donors in a long term perspective. Before investing in raising funds from foundations, a detailed plan should be outlined to ensure the optimal screening and avoid waste of time</li> <li>Four concept papers have been drafted aimed at reframing TBBC's programme in a developmental perspective. They can be used to appeal for general unrestricted support on a percentage or by-camp basis. The rationale is for first contact with new donors, and making the coherence of different activities more visible</li> <li>Part of the quality of TBBC's program comes from its very extensive semi annual report. However, no other account of the TBBC programme is available</li> <li>It would be beneficial to bring a certain level of outside assistance and expertise into TBBC: hire a full time fundraiser, engage outside consultants and/or seek the help of the member organisations.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC continues to approach Governmental donors on the basis of Good Humanitarian Donorship</li> <li>TBBC Board members have researched Member policies on Corporate Fundraising, and a TBBC policy has been written.</li> <li>TBBC is subscribing to an online database and plans to approach suitable Corporations and Foundations</li> <li>A TBBC website was set up in June 2006 and is being continuously developed.</li> <li>A TBBC brochure has been published.</li> <li>Two TBBC members raised funds through donations to project components</li> <li>A list of donation options has been established on the website</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It is clear that TBBC's funding strategy needs re-consideration and prioritisation.</li> <li>Priority in 2007 has been to develop the UNHCR/CCSDPT Comprehensive plan as a context and strategy for fund raising.</li> <li>It is hoped to develop the "project funding menu" during 2007</li> <li>Staff capacity is an issue. CWS has offered help in developing the funding menu and TBBC has requested a SIDA placement for an information officer with writing skills. However direct recruitment might prove necessary</li> </ul>
22	Oct 2006	WFP*	Food distribution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The food needs of the refugees are currently adequately covered by TBBC</li> <li>WFP strongly acknowledges the dedicated and skilled manner in which TBBC implements the food aid operation</li> <li>The community involvement in TBBC's operations is essential for ownership, accountability, and transparency. At the same time there is room for improvement on technical issues</li> <li>The involvement of WFP, which is presently not operational in Thailand, is not considered necessary. WFP will however continue to be ready to assist with technical advice when needed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TBBC to provide some more training on godown management and ensure implementation of the skills learnt.</li> <li>The quantity of food received should be acknowledged by the refugee household receiving the food in form of a signature or thump prints.</li> <li>The ration books should be retained by refugees themselves and include a column for signature or thump print.</li> <li>Monthly Post Distribution Monitoring is recommended to capture vital information like actual use of food (quantity traded, amount shared with relatives, quantity actually consumed)</li> <li>consider sending staff to WFP's operations to broaden their knowledge base on food aid operations.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Warehouse staff training, is being intensified</li> <li>Ration books have been modified</li> <li>Some procedural changes have been made to TBBC monitoring procedures.</li> <li>TBBC staff visited WFP's operation with Bhutanese Refugees' in Nepal during an exchange visit.</li> </ul>	

23	Jan 2007	Channel Research*	ERA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The purpose of this study is to encourage the intended users to view the lessons from a strategic, long term perspective. The ERA partners are the main audience</li> <li>Based on OECD DAC criteria, the program has met the criteria of 'relevance', 'impact', 'effectiveness' and 'efficiency' but the extent to which each of the four criteria is met is different. The strongest result comes from 'relevance'</li> <li>The ERA program is assessed as achieving excellent targeting of beneficiaries who are the most vulnerable.</li> <li>Another strong result comes from meeting the aim of 'Do No Harm'. Social harmony is maintained at the grassroots level. This means that the mechanisms that TBBC uses to deliver assistance are conflict sensitive at the grassroots level.</li> <li>In terms of 'coherence' - there isn't a common logic and consistency of the policies and programs of the different donors and agencies.</li> <li>Given there is no convergence of logic and consistency at the large scale level of aid agencies, the 'connectedness' criterion has to be revised.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A Logical Framework should be developed to help clarity of objective and build the project management component of ERA</li> <li>Needs assessments should move away from addressing the effects of a past threat to helping beneficiaries prepare for a future threat.</li> <li>Need to increase protection levels of IDPs and vulnerable groups. Should find ways to decrease beneficiaries' time exposure to danger and look at ways to help cope with future threats, including using an Early Warning System and / or preparedness of early flight. Also consider infrastructure such as rice barns for beneficiaries who have just fled to a new area, first aid kits, communications equipment, rafting equipment, etc</li> <li>The needs of the vulnerable have to be better defined by women, children, the aged and the handicapped. This will help build a gender perspective in the program</li> <li>Targeting accuracy is the main strength and comparative advantage of the ERA and this should be emphasized to donors. TBBC should frequently provide quantitative data of percentages of population reached, amount of aid dollars spent and calculate the reduced probability / chances that an IDP becomes a refugee because of ERA.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A Logframe was developed with ERA partners and incorporated into the 2007 ERA Annual Report.</li> <li>6 workshops with ERA partner agencies have developed needs and impact assessment skills, as well as gender awareness for 90 field staff.</li> <li>A convergence process of information sharing between aid agencies working from both sides of the was facilitated in 2007 to promote a complementary approach to protection.</li> <li>Over 600,000 baht invested in communications and rafting equipment for early warning systems and preparedness for early flight. Storage and security risks are generally deemed to great for rice barns.</li> <li>Programme reach continues to be analysed in terms of state, division, township, age, gender, religion, ethnicity, and causes of vulnerability. To strengthen the analysis of programme reach, ERA registration data was compared against overall IDP survey data in the 2007 ERA Annual Report. This found that 60% of ERA beneficiaries during the past 2 years were from the most contested areas in eastern Burma.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The protection of civilians in armed conflict (ie, to stop ongoing abuses and prevent their recurrence) remains a key challenge, not only for TBBC but all humanitarian actors in Burma.</li> <li>A more focused conflict impact assessment of the ERA programme is under consideration as part of the consultancy commissioned by Caritas.</li> </ul>
24	Apr 2007	NCCA/ AusAID	Overall	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The TBBC programme is an excellent programme ... managed and implemented in a very efficient and professional way. The staff is committed and professional, monitoring and logistical systems are excellent and the programmes are highly relevant.</li> <li>The red line in the recommendations is that, due to various reasons, the pressure on the programme will increase in the near future.</li> <li>Resettlement, intake of new refugees, lack of hope for people after many years of being a refugee will have their impact on the atmosphere, relationships and peaceful living together in the camps</li> <li>TBBC with such a huge amount of monthly purchases is structurally facing problems in having sufficient financial capacity to pay all the bills on time regularly.</li> <li>With TBBC's relatively small staff the danger of over asking of people is always there. Adequate staffing numbers in relation to the tasks on TBBC's shoulders should be appointed.</li> <li>TBBC is being governed and managed very well. Staff members make a competent, satisfied and sharp impression and are performing with confidence and on a good quality level. The top management is also very competent and experienced.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>intensify research of the food basket in a more creative and innovative way with more variety and access to different food items</li> <li>By end 2007 all warehouses brought on acceptable quality levels and by end of 2008 organised, maintained and brought into the condition according to the ECHO/SPHERE standards</li> <li>further capacitate of the camp committees before the end of 2007.</li> <li>Address the heavy workload of the staff. Consider appointment of a qualified staff member for the preparation of visits (programmes) and hosting of visitors</li> <li>Urgently address issue of liquidity scarcity with members and resource partners</li> <li>Take initiatives (via CCSDPT) to encourage governments to develop an international code for policies and criteria related to resettlement that matches the interests of resettled people.</li> <li>valuable work of the legal aid centres and the women's organisations on the field of empowering women in the struggle against gender based violence should be supported by programmes focussing on men, men's behaviour, attitudes and responsibilities.</li> </ul>	<p>These are all ongoing issues being addressed in a variety of ways:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The tedious nature of the food basket is being addressed by encouraging home gardens and will improve if refugees have more income and purchasing power</li> <li>Warehouse standards are constantly under review and improvement with WFP standards as the objective</li> <li>Strengthening camp management capacity is a CCSDPT/ UNHCR Comprehensive Plan gap and one which TBBC is committed to. A staff person is currently being recruited to facilitate this.</li> <li>A Human Resources Manager has been recruited, who is reviewing Staff job descriptions and work loads. It is unlikely that a staff will be designated for visitors since this is seen as an integral part of filed staff duties</li> <li>TBBC is constantly raising cash-flow problems with members and donors. This is an issue which needs to be given higher priority by the Board/ Members</li> <li>TBBC took a lead in commissioning a study of the impact of resettlement and will pursue responses through CCSDPT/ UNHCR. This will included addressing information gaps and government policies</li> <li>TBBC is not directly involved in LACs or SGBV programmes, but is aware of the need to involve men in all gender planning</li> </ul>	
25	Jul 2007	EC	Ex-post monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To be added</li> </ul>			

26	Sep 2007	ECHO	Audit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• TBBC's is a well established organisation and the structure and various forms of oversight that are in place are considered appropriate for the task of implementing the DG ECHO-funded activities.</li> <li>• TBBC has a well established accounting system that is able to account for and report on funds used under the DG ECHO grant agreement.</li> <li>• TBBC's procurement procedures respect the requirements of Annex V of the FPA. TBBC's files are well organised and provide adequate evidence of the need to procure through competition.</li> <li>• Elements of a fraud and corruption policy are in place, but further work is required to introduce training on identification and assessment of fraud and corruption risk for staff, and to formalise procedures to be adopted in the event of fraud being discovered.</li> <li>• The majority of food and fuel is being delivered and distributed to eligible beneficiaries within the camps. Within the supply chain, there is a good system of documentation that records quantities ordered, delivered and distributed. However the population feeding figures are compromised by the lack of a baseline figure and eligibility criteria specifying who is entitled to receive assistance are unclear.</li> <li>• Monitoring is well structured, periodic, provides an effective system of feedback to activities in the camp and serves to highlight those areas where corrective action may be necessary.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An application should be made to the Royal Thai Government for exemption from VAT.</li> <li>• TBBC should seek to retain a sufficient cash reserve to ensure adequate liquidity and to enable continuation of activities in the event of delayed contributions from donors.</li> <li>• The Financial Procedures Manual should include exchange rate procedures.</li> <li>• Tender evaluation committee members should sign declarations of impartiality and confidentiality, The Evaluation of Tender / Contract Award should clearly state the reasons for selection and rejection, and be signed by of all the evaluation committee members. Firms whose offers are rejected should be formally notified. The frequency of tenders can be reviewed.</li> <li>• Procedures for investigation of suspected fraud should be formalised and staff awareness of fraud and corruption risks should be heightened.</li> <li>• Donors, such as the DG ECHO office and EC Delegation in Bangkok, should approach the Royal Thai Government requesting greater flexibility to enable new arrivals to the camps to register as refugees and to permit measures to increase the self-reliance of refugees in the camps.</li> <li>• Measures should be taken to verify the accuracy of the feeding population figures.</li> <li>• Procedures governing ration cards should be enhanced.</li> <li>• Monitoring procedures should be enhanced, to include verification of the population feeding figures and ensuring quantities of rations delivered and distributed reconcile through the supply chain.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It has been confirmed that the Thailand tax laws do not provide for exemptions to be granted to TBBC and ECHO have agreed that donors would have to take responsibility to lobby the Royal Thai Government.</li> <li>• A target level to cover expenses and maintain adequate liquidity is defined in the TBBC Reserves policy.</li> <li>• All Accounting policies are now included in the Financial Procedures Manual.</li> <li>• All tender evaluation recommendations have been implemented.</li> <li>• TBBC is currently working with a consultant to develop a Risk Management Plan. Fraud awareness training is planned for a staff workshop in September 2008.</li> <li>• The EC has led the formation of a donor working group to engage the Royal Thai Government.</li> <li>• Feeding figures are now reconciled at the Section level, there are checks on new arrivals and eligibility criteria has been developed to exclude those not in camp.</li> <li>• New standard household ration cards for 2008 show entitlement and require sign off for quantity received.</li> <li>• Post distribution monitoring in 2008 will monitor rations received at the distribution point and include household visits to determine how rations are used.</li> </ul>	
27	Feb 2007	EC	Strategic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To be added</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	
28	Feb 2008	DFID	Review of aid to refugees and IDPS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To be added</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	
29	Jun 2008	Independent	Risk Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To be added</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>	

\* Commissioned by TBBC  
Updated: 18<sup>th</sup> July 2008